NOMINATIONS COMMITTEE

AGENDA

A meeting of the Nominations Committee will be held on Monday 13 June 2022 at 09:30 via Microsoft Teams.

		Lead Speaker	**Paper**
1	WELCOME & APOLOGIES	Chair	
2	DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST	Chair	
3	MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING *for approval*	Chair	A
4	MATTERS ARISING REPORT	Chair	B
5	CODE OF PRACTICE FOR MINISTERIAL APPOINTMENTS TO PUBLIC BODIES IN SCOTLAND	M Walker	C **Attached**
6	BOARD MEMBERSHIP, TENURE AND CAPACITY	M Walker	D

Item 6 is presently exempt from publication under the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002, Section 27, Information Intended for Future Publication.

7	MEMBERSHIP AND ATTENDANCE REVIEW 2021/22	M Walker	E **Attached**
8	ANY OTHER COMPETENT BUSINESS 8.1 Review of Committee Operation 2021/22	M Walker	F **Attached**
9	DATE OF NEXT MEETING: To be confirmed		

NOMINATIONS COMMITTEE
13 JUNE 2022
PAPER C

Title	Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland
Appendices	None.
Disclosable under FOISA	Yes
Primary Contact	Marcus Walker, Board Secretary
Date of Production	07.06.22
Action Required	Information / Discussion

1. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

   The Nominations Committee is asked to note the Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland, and to agree to review its own *Non-Executive Appointment Procedures* at its next meeting in early 2022/23 - prior to any subsequent requirement rounds taking place.

2. **PURPOSE OF REPORT**

   The Ethical Standards Commissioner has published a revised Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland.

   The Code will not come into effect until 3 October 2022 with a view to ensuring that everyone who plays a part in the appointments process will be ready for its implementation.

3. **DETAIL**

   3.1   The revised Code

   The Code, which can be viewed here, is an important tool in securing the appointments of the right people for the right roles. It is rooted in good practice in recruitment and selection and intended to help selection panels design appointment rounds that deliver the skills, knowledge and experience needed as well as being welcoming and accessible to people from all backgrounds. The new Code is focused on enabling more creative and ambitious approaches to attracting and appointing the best new board members from the widest possible pool of applicants.

   3.2   Who does the Code apply to?

   The Code applies to appointments made by the Scottish Ministers to non-executive and similar positions on the boards of Scotland's regulated public bodies. The Code is designed for use by:

   - the Scottish Minister
   - officials who implement the public appointments process on behalf of the Scottish Ministers
   - members of selection panels who plan appointment activity and assess applicants for positions on the boards of Scotland's regulated public bodies
   - selection panel chairs, designated by the Scottish Ministers to make all key decisions on their behalf

- boards themselves, whose role in community engagement and succession planning is integral to the successful implementation of the Code's provisions.

3.3   Next steps

To ensure that Edinburgh College Board of Management complies with the Code, it is proposed that the Board's own *Non-Executive Appointment Procedures* are reviewed by the Nominations Committee at its next meeting (in early AY 2022/23).

Further to this, the Committee will also be asked to review and (if applicable) update its *Inclusive Recruitment, Selection and Development Checklist* to deliver on the requirements of the new Code.

4.   IMPACT AND IMPLICATIONS

The Board shall ensure that its operation aligns with the Post-16 Education Act (2013) and it non-executive appointments adhere to the principles outlined in the Code of Practice for Ministerial Appointments to Public Bodies in Scotland.

5.   LINKS TO STRATEGIC PLAN AND KPIs

The activities and key priorities described in this report are linked to the 'efficient and effective college' strategic aims.

MEMBERSHIP AND ATTENDANCE REVIEW REPORT 2021/22

1. MEMBERSHIP & TENURES

1.1   Board of Management

In alignment with the Post-16 Education Act (2013), Edinburgh College continues to formally review its Board membership in the academic year 2021/22. The Board consists of 15 members (out of a possible 18), with the Regional Chair's post currently vacant.

A full list of Board members and their tenures are attached as *Appendix 1.1*.

1.2   Chair

1.2.1   Interim Chair of the Board Arrangements

On 24 September 2019, the Board agreed that Ann Landels, a Non-Executive Board Member and Vice Chair of the Board, would act as Interim Chair from 01 November 2019 until a new Regional Chair had been appointed by Scottish Government.

The Board reaffirmed its commitment to the above interim governance arrangements at its meeting on 16 June 2020, which have remained in place throughout the academic years 2020/21 and 2021/22.

1.2.2   Appointment of Regional Chair

It is expected that the appointment of a new Regional Chair will be confirmed on 4 July 2022.

1.3   Non-Executive Membership

1.3.1   Membership

As of the beginning of the 2021/22 academic year, the following 11 Non-Executive Members of the Edinburgh College Board of Management were in post:

Lesley Drummond	Vivaldi (Owner), Edinburgh-based independent fashion retailer.
Alex Killick	Former Director of People at Glasgow Caledonian University.
Janyce Holmes	Former Executive Director, with background in commercial International organisations
Ross Laird	Director / Head of Scotland at Grayling Communications Ltd.
Ann Landels	Former Director, Crisis Skylight.
Toni McAlindin	Employment law consultant and a qualified barrister
Nigel Paul	Retired; ex Director of Corporate Services, Edinburgh University; CA.
Gwen Raez	Senior Marketing Manager, Visit Scotland.
Fiona Riddoch	Management Consultant.
Azra Sharif-Qayyum	Biomedical scientist and founding member of the Edinburgh Mela.
Jeanette Stevenson	Associate Director, NHS Scotland Academy.

The tenure of Toni McAlindin ended on 29 September 2021, following a decision to step down from the Board due a change in personal circumstances.

After six years of service to the Board, Azra Sharif-Qayyum's tenure as a non-executive member ended on 9 February 2022.

Following over eight years of service as a Non-Executive Board Member and Chair of the Audit & Risk Assurance Committee, the tenure of Nigel Paul ended on 1 March 2022.

1.3.2   Appointments

To date, two new non-executive appointments have been made in the academic year 2021/22.

A phase of recruitment commenced in August 2021 which led to the appointment of Stewart Darling, Former CEO of the Vianet Group Plc., and Kerry McCormack, Global Head of IT for First Sentier Investors, as Non-Executive Members - with approval provided by the Cabinet Secretary for Further Education, Higher Education and Science and the Board on 15 December 2021.

Both new Non-Executive Members received an induction to the Board in alignment with the procedures agreed by the Nominations Committee. This included new Board members receipt of a college e-mail address, general information, and key governance documents.

In addition to the above information, all new Non-Executive Board Members were provided with an opportunity to meet with the Chair, Vice Chair, Principal, Student President, and Board Secretary.

New Board members are registered with the College Development Network (CDN) and can access learning resources on its online HUB. Online induction events for new members of the Board organised through CDN have taken place.

On 16 March 2022, the Board launched a second round of non-executive recruitment seeking two new members with experience in the following areas: *Community engagement; working with young people; the voluntary sector; and Local business / enterprise.* An advert for the role was published on 16 March 2022, with interviews taking place on 6 June 2022.

The outcome of the recruitment round is expected to be confirmed by Scottish Government in July 2022.

1.3.3   Reappointments / Tenure Extensions

The Board, on 29 September 2021, endorsed a proposal to grant an extension to the tenure of Fiona Riddoch as a Non-Executive Board Member until 30 June 2022. This extension was subsequently approved by the Scottish Government and ensured that the Board retained appropriate membership levels until the end of the academic year.

Further to a decision by the Board on 14 December 2021, the Scottish Government confirmed in February 2022 that the tenures of Ross Laird and Gwen Raez, as Non-Executive Board Members, had been extended by a further 3-years until 8 March 2025.

1.4   Staff Board Members

Bruce Cassidy continued to hold office as Support Staff Board Member following his election in December 2020. Mr Cassidy will hold office until 2 December 2024.

Mike Cowley held office as Lecturing Staff Board Member until 1 December 2021.

In line with good practice guidance for the election of staff Board members, a ballot to elect a Lecturing Staff Board Member commenced on 16 November 2021 for a period of 14 days. On 2 December 2021, the Board were informed that Richard Swan had been elected to hold office for a 4-year term. Mr Swan will hold office until 2 December 2025.

In March 2019, the Board agreed that until the Good Governance Steering Group (GGSG) had formally implemented changes to the Code of Good Governance for Scotland's College[1], EIS-FELA and Unison representatives would be invited to attend Board meetings as observers. In furtherance of this, letters from the then Chair were sent to both recognised trade unions on 21 May 2019.

Donny Gluckstein (EIS-FELA) and Kevin Dixon (Unison) were invited to attend all meetings of the Board of Management in 2021/22, as observers. All Board meetings in 2021/22 had at least one trade union observer in attendance.

1.5   Student Board Members

On 1 July 2021 Rose Dodgson (Student President) and Jordan Wyllie (Vice President, Welfare) were formally appointed to the Board as Student Members, as per the agreed nominations procedure.

1.6   Principal & CEO

The Principal & Chief Executive, Audrey Cumberford, was appointment on 3 September 2018 and remains in post.

1.7   Vice Chair & Senior Independent Member

As noted under Paragraph 1.2.2, the Vice Chair of the Board, Ann Landels, assumed the role of Interim Chair on 1 November 2019.

Further to this, the Board agreed on 16 June 2020 that Nigel Paul (a Non-Executive Member) would act as Interim Vice Chair from 1 November 2019 until a new Regional Chair was appointed by Scottish Government.

Prior to the end of Nigel Paul's tenure on 1 March 2022, the Board agreed (on 14 December 2022) that Fiona Riddoch would act as Interim Vice Chair from 2 March 2022 until the appointment of a new Regional Chair.

Following the appointment of a new Regional Chair, Ann Landels will resume the role of Vice Chair.

---

[1] On 18 February 2019, the Minister for Further Education, Higher Education and Science, wrote to the Convenor of the Scottish Parliament's Education and Skills Committee outlining his decisions following the Good Governance Consultation which was published in April 2017. This included a decision to *introduce two trade union nominees to the boards of colleges, in addition to the existing staff representatives, bringing the college sector into line with changes made in universities by the Higher Education Governance Act 2016.*

1.8 Board Secretary

As agreed by the Board on 14 December 2021, the role of Board Secretary was transferred from the Director of Communications, Policy & Research (Nick Croft) to the Clerk to the Board (Marcus Walker) from 23 March 2022 onwards.

2. BOARD BALANCE

2.1 Gender

At the start of the 2021/22 academic year, the Board gender balance stood at 61% female and 39% male. Following changes in the composition of the Board throughout the academic year the gender balance is 60% female and 40% male.

The gender balance of the non-executive membership of the Board currently stands at 70% female and 30% male.

2.2 Skill, Knowledge and Experience

To support decision-making around non-executive recruitment and succession planning a Board member profile and skill matrix is maintained by the Board Secretary.

On 18 September 2020, the Nominations Committee agreed to adopt a skills matrix template endorsed by CDN. Following an audit of non-executive members' broad knowledge and skills, updated versions of the skills matrix was presented to the Committee on 9 September 2021, 8 December 2021, and 13 June 2022.

3. COMMITTEES OF THE BOARD

3.1 Structure

As reaffirmed in September 2021, the Board operated with the following committee structure in 2021/22:

- Audit & Risk Assurance Committee
- Corporate Development Committee
- Learning, Teaching & Student Experience
- Nominations Committee
- Policy & Resources Committee
- Remuneration Committee

The Academic Council, on 10 September 2021, agreed to propose significant updates to its terms of reference. This included a change in the Academic Council title to the *Learning, Teaching & Student Experience Committee*, to capture all aspects of the Committee's work. The Board of Management on 29 September 2021 approved the update terms of reference for the Committee.

All committees operate under the authority of the Board. Minutes were circulated to all Board members following every meeting, and each committee chair (or a nominated representative) reports to the Board on committee business. The Board has approved Terms of Reference for all six committees, and these are available on the Board webpages.

3.2 Membership

On 8 November 2021, the Nominations Committee endorsed a Committee Membership Proposal put forward by the Interim Chair of the Board. The Proposal was subsequently approved by the Board on 14 December 2021 and implemented for all future meetings. *[Appendix 1.2 refers]*

As part of its consideration the Nominations Committee considered the Board Skills Matrix and succession planning information to ensure an appropriate distribution of knowledge and experience across each committee.

3.3 Co-opted Membership

3.3.1 *Audit & Risk Assurance Committee*

In May 2015, the Board agreed to co-opt an additional member of the Audit & Risk Assurance Committee with public service expertise. Ian Doig, an experienced non-executive director, and former Director of CIPFA in Scotland, was co-opted to the Committee with the endorsement of the Nomination Committee until 31 July 2022.

On 12 May 2021, the Nominations Committee agreed that, before the end of the academic year 2021/22, a new Independent Member of the Audit & Risk Assurance Committee would be appointed to replace Mr Doig - who had served on the Committee for six consecutive years.

In April 2022, an advert was published seeking a new Independent Member of the Committee. As of writing, an appointment has yet to be made.

3.3.2 *Learning, Teaching & Student Experience (LTSE) Committee*

As part of changes outlined under Paragraph 3.1, the LTSE Committee (and the Board) agreed that amendments to its co-opted membership, as outlined below, should be implemented before the academic year 2022/23. This includes the co-option of the following members of staff:

- *One member of lecturing staff from each faculty.*
- *One Curriculum Leader.*
- *One Curriculum Manager.*
- *One part-time member of lecturing staff.*

The changes agreed will ensure that the co-opted membership of the Committee is representative of the College's curriculum staff and faculties.

4. ATTENDANCE

4.1 Board and Committees

In AY 2021/22, the Board at its committees met a total of 25 times, one meeting less than in the previous academic year.

To comply with social distancing measures all Board and committee meetings in early 2021/22 were held remotely. Following the easing of Covid-19 restrictions the Board meetings on 22 March 2022 and 14 June 2022 were held on the Granton and Milton Road Campuses - respectively.

All meetings of the Board and its committees were quorate in the academic year 2021/22.

Despite a demanding cycle of meetings, and the impacts of the Covid-19 Pandemic, the level of attendance remains high at 93.4% - an increase of 2.4% from the last academic year.

The *Appendix 1.3* shows the attendance of members at meetings of the Board and its committees in AY 2021/22.

No individual Board members attendance dropped below 75% in the academic year 2021/22.

Nominations Committee attendance was recorded at 86%, which was the lowest attendance score across all the committees.

In addition to their membership of committees, the Interim Chair and the Principal attended committees to which they had a right of attendance.

4.2   Strategic and Development Events

In addition to Board and committee meetings, members of the Board have attended a number of internally and externally led strategic and development events. Below is a list of such events (including those that have contributed to good governance) attended in the academic year 2021/22:

Event	Date(s)	Location	No. of Board Attendees
Governance Related			
Board Briefing Session	25.08.21	Online	10
Board Strategy Session	26.10.21	Online	14
Board Briefing Session	03.02.22	Online	11
Board Strategy Session	26.04.22	Granton	14
Training and Development			
Board Development Session	09.02.22	Online	10

4.3   Other Meetings/Events

In addition to meetings within the Board and committee cycle, a number of members have attended meetings/events in the interests of the Board. It should however be noted that due to the social distancing restrictions in place – throughout early 2021/22 - several events were cancelled or postponed.

A full list of meetings/events (and their attendees) are held by the Board Secretary.

BOARD MEMBERSHIP & TENURES

As of 1 June 2022, the Edinburgh College Board of Management membership is as follows:

	Forename	Surname	Position	Date of Appointment	Tenure Expires
1	Bruce	Cassidy	Support Staff Member	02.12.20	02.12.24
2	Stewart	Darling	Non-Executive	15.12.22	15.12.24*
3	Audrey	Cumberford	Principal	03.09.18	Not applicable
4	Rose	Dodgson	ECSA Student President	01.07.21	30.06.22
5	Lesley	Drummond	Non-Executive	01.03.17	01.03.23
6	Janyce	Holmes	Non-Executive	15.03.21	15.03.24*
7	Ross	Laird	Non-Executive	08.03.19	08.03.25
8	Ann	Landels	Non-Executive (Interim Chair)	09.02.16	09.02.23
9	Alex	Killick	Non-Executive	22.09.20	22.09.23*
10	Kerry	McCormack	Non-Executive	15.12.22	15.12.24*
11	Gwen	Raez	Non-Executive	08.03.19	08.03.25
12	Fiona	Riddoch	Non-Executive (Interim Vice Chair)	20.10.15	30.06.22
13	Jeanette	Stevenson	Non-Executive	01.03.17	01.03.23
14	Richard	Swan	Lecturing Staff Member	02.12.22	02.12.25
15	Jordan	Wyllie	ECSA Vice President (Welfare)	01.07.21	30.06.22

Indicates a Non-Executive Member who may seek reappointment following the end of their initial period of tenure.

An updated register of interests for the Edinburgh College Board of Management can be found on the College website [here](#).

EDINBURGH COLLEGE BOARD OF MANAGEMENT - COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP (22 MARCH 2022 TO PRESENT)

	LTSE Committee	Audit & Risk Assurance Committee	Corporate Development Committee	Policy & Resources Committee	Nominations Committee	Remuneration Committee
Non-Executive Membership	Jeanette Stevenson (C) Ross Laird Kerry McCormack	Janyce Holmes (C) Fiona Riddoch Lesley Drummond Stewart Darling	Lesley Drummond (C) Gwen Raez Ann Landels	Ann Landels (C) Fiona Riddoch (VC) Janyce Holmes Lesley Drummond Alex Killick *Vacancy (Regional Chair)*	Ann Landels (C) Fiona Riddoch (VC) Jeanette Stevenson Lesley Drummond Alex Killick	Alex Killick (C) Ross Laird Gwen Raez
Principal, Staff, Student Members	Audrey Cumberford Rose Dodgson Richard Swan		Rose Dodgson Bruce Cassidy	Rose Dodgson	Jordan Wyllie Bruce Cassidy Richard Swan	Jordan Wyllie
Co-opted Members	X5 Academic staff X2 Student reps	Ian Doig				

In addition to the Committee Membership Proposal above, the Board are asked to note that Ross Laird and Gwen Raez sit on the Edinburgh College Development Trust - as representatives of the Board of Management

BOARD AND COMMITTEE ATTENDANCE AY 2020/21

The following table shows the attendance of members at meetings of the Board and its committees in AY 2021/22:

		Board of Management	LTSE Committee	Audit & Risk Assurance	Corporate Development	Nominations	Policy & Resources	Remuneration	TOTAL
1	Bruce Cassidy	4/4			3/4	2/3			9/11
2	Mike Cowley	1/1	1/1			1/1			3/3
3	Audrey Cumberford	4/4	3/4						7/8
4	Stewart Darling	2/2		2/2					5/5
5	Rose Dodgson	4/4	4/4		3/4		4/4		15/16
6	Lesley Drummond	3/4		3/4		1/1	4/4		11/13
7	Janyce Holmes	4/4	2/2	4/4			1/1		11/11
8	Alex Killick	3/4				1/1	4/4	2/2	10/11
9	Ross Laird	4/4	2/2					2/2	8/8
10	Ann Landels	4/4			4/4		4/4		12/12
11	Kerry McCormack	2/2	2/2						4/4
12	Nigel Paul	2/2		3/3		2/2	3/3		10/10
13	Gwen Raez	3/4			3/4			2/2	8/10
14	Fiona Riddoch	4/4		1/2		3/3	2/2		10/11
15	Azra Sharif-Qayyum	2/2			2/2	1/2			5/6
16	Jeanette Stevenson	4/4	4/4			2/3	4/4		14/15
17	Richard Swan	2/2	2/2			2/2			6/6
18	Jordan Wyllie	4/4				3/3		1/2	7/9
Overall Total		**54/57**	**20/21**	**13/15**	**17/18**	**18/21**	**26/26**	**7/8**	

Review of Nominations Committee Operation 2021/22 - Part 1

Membership	Y/N	Comments
Has the Committee's membership been compliant with its terms of reference during the past year?	Y	In alignment with its terms of reference, three non-executive members, two staff members and one student member sit on the Committee. On 14 December 2021, the Board agreed that two additional non-executive members of the Board should join the Committee.
Are there any skills gaps that the Committee would bring to the attention of the Nominations Committee?	N	No further comment.
Meetings		
Has the committee met in accordance with its terms of reference and often enough to fulfil its remit?	Y	The Committee is required to meet no less than once per year. The Committee has met via Microsoft Teams on three occasions in 2021/22, on the following dates: 9 September 2021; 8 December 2021; and, 13 June 2022.
Have all meetings been quorate?	Y	At least two non-executive members and one full member, as required by the terms of reference, have been in-attendance.
Administration		
Have pre-meetings assisted in the planning of Committee business?	Y	The Chair has liaised with the Board Secretary in advance of meetings to confirm an agenda and papers.
Have papers been issued sufficiently in advance of meetings?	Y	Committee papers are circulated to members a week in-advance of meetings. Any delay to the circulation of papers is agreed with the Chair of the Committee in advance.
Have minutes and actions been distributed in good time after meetings?	Y	Minutes are circulated to the Committee following approval by the Chair. All minutes are reported to the next appropriate meeting of the Board of Management by the Chair.
Are there any other points Members would like to raise?	Y	The Committee shall continue to monitor Board / committee succession planning and the need to ensure that the Board / Audit & Risk Assurance Committee has a member with suitable chartered accountancy experience.

Review of Nominations Committee Operation 2021/22 - Part 2

Performance Monitoring Role

1. Is the Committee monitoring the KPIs it needs to in line with its remit or is there a need for review or change?

    The Committee monitored Board members tenures and the Board Skills Matrix at all three of its meeting in 2021/22, for the purpose of forward planning.

    At two meetings of the Committee in 2021/22, members have monitored the progress of the Board against an Equality, Diversity and Inclusivity Checklist. The Checklist outlines key actions to ensure the Board adheres to recognised best practice around ED&I in its recruitment procedures.

2. Does the Committee receive the information it needs to monitor performance effectively?

    Yes, however, the Committee will continued to keep this under review.

3. Have there been any areas where the Committee has not been able to exercise its performance monitoring role effectively or where practice could be improved?

    None.

Strategic Role

4. How would the Committee define the key strategic issues within its remit?

    In terms of the Committee's role in identifying and recommending to the Board of Management suitable candidates for membership, the Committee must maintain a forward-looking view to meet the immediate challenges of the College and the Scottish economy.

    The Committee, in light of developments to governance within the college sector, may need to assess individuals' abilities to engage fully in Board activities (for instance, the need to attend mandatory national training events).

5. In what ways has the Committee influenced strategy in its area of remit in the last year?

    The Committee has given due consideration to gender balance and other equality and diversity matters. Further to this, the Committee have considered how the membership of the Board can meet the broad areas of expertise identified by the Scottish Government.

    In a practical manner, the Committee has influenced strategy (in its broadest sense) by aiming to recruit high-calibre Board members whose composition is well balanced.

6. Are there particular areas in which the Committee might improve practice in relation to its strategic role?

    None. However, the Committee will continue to keep this matter under review.

Decision-Making

7. Has decision-making been "transparent, informed, rigorous and timely[1]" in the past year?

   The Committee's decision-making is in line with its Terms of Reference and its Induction/Development procedures.

   The Committee has received appropriate papers relating to matters within its remit and deals with them in a timely manner.

8. Are there ways that the Committee could strengthen its practice in relation to decision-making?

   The Committee believes that its current practice reflects good practice, in line with the Good Governance Code. Practice in relation to decision-making is clearly outlined with the Nominations Committee's terms of reference.

9. Are there examples that show how the student experience has informed and been central to the Committee's decisions?

   One Student Board Member sits on the Nominations Committee and contributes directly to the Committee's decision making. Additionally, the Student Board Member was invited to attend shortlisting event and interview process to assist in the initial selection of Board applicants for interview.

Relationships

10. Has the Committee's relationship with the Board been effective in the past year, and are there any examples of where it could have been more effective?

    The Interim Chair of the Board also acts as Chair to the Committee and is joined on the Committee by two Non-Executive members, two staff members of the Board and one student member.

    On 14 December 2021, the Board agreed that two additional Non-Executive Members should be invited to join the Nominations Committee. This brings the non-executive membership of the Committee to four persons (excluding the Interim Chair)..

    The Interim Chair and Non-Executive members have links, through membership, with other committees of the Board, including the: Policy & Resources Committee, Audit & Risk Assurance Committee, Corporate Development Committee, LTSE Committee, and the Remuneration Committee.

    The Committee, through its Chair, reports its minutes to the Board and provides additional supporting papers – as required.

11. Has the Committee's relationship with the Executive been effective in the past year, and are there any examples of where it could have been more effective?

    Not applicable.

---

[1] This is a definition of effective decision-making given in the Code of Good Governance for Scotland's Colleges.

12. Has the boundary between governance and management been effective in practice in the past year or are there examples of where it could have been more effective?

Not applicable.